## Alternative Fuel Vehicles at Brookhaven National Laboratory

#### **Successes and Challenges**





March 16, 2011 Mark Toscano Manager, Energy Management



a passion for discovery





# Brookhaven National Laboratory A passion for discovery

5321 acres 350 buildings ~4.2M sq ft 29 miles paved roads

12 miles sidewalks

Housing for ~800



~2800 employees											
>4000 guest users per year											
	FY 08	FY 09	FY 10								
	\$532M	\$880M	\$700M								

man in it

**Brookhaven Science Associates** 

#### Brookhaven National Laboratory Energy Use FY 2009



Note: Vehicle fuels ~ 99,000 Gal/year (includes 25,000 gallons of diesel)

3



**Process** 

## **Transportation Vehicle- Overview**

- 292 Vehicles of mixed use on site: ~35% are Alternative Fuel
- Compressed natural gas (CNG) fueling infrastructure installed 2001
  - 75 CNG vehicles displaced 23,900 GGE (~25% of total) in 2010
  - BNL provides compressed natural gas refueling to local governments that partner with DOE Clean Cities
- E85 refueling infrastructure operational late 2010
  - 27 Vehicles
- Biodiesel displacing about 20% of the vehicle diesel consumption
  - Started early 2010
- Neighborhood electric vehicles to replace some conventional-fuel vehicles







## **CNG - Overview**

#### CNG Facility - Installed late 2001

- 3000 / 3600 PSI fueling pressure Fast fill @ ~ 600 SCFM (5 GGE/min)
- 1 Bauer 40 SCFM (30 HP) compressor
- 30,000 SCF storage
- Tulsa fuel dispensers with card readers
- Enclosure for compressor(s), controls, drier
- \$378,000 construction contract. \$575,000 Total Project Cost

#### Second Compressor - Added 2005

- 1 Bauer 40 SCFM compressor
- Controls upgrade/conversion to Allen-Bradley PLC
- \$215,000





## **CNG – Original Estimate**

#### **Natural Gas Vehicles**

Updated: 6/14/2000

All Cost Values are 2000\$

		Ave.	Ave.	52 wks	Average: 7 Days, 24 hrs/day									Nat. Gas	Incremental	
End of	No.	Miles	Miles	gge	gge	gge	gge/hr		Nat. Gas Nat. Gas		Therms	Cubic Feet	Nat Gas	Fuel	Vehicle	Infrastructure
Year	Vehicles	per year	per gge	per year	per week	per day	24 hr day	Ft <sup>3</sup> /Wk	Ft <sup>3</sup> /day CFM		per year	per year	Cost	Savings	Cost	Cost
2000	20	4,000	12	6,667	128	18	0.76	15,385	2,192	1.52	8,333	800,000	\$3,823	\$1,577	\$30,177	
2001	32	4,000	13	9,600	185	26	1.10	22,154	3,156	2.19	12,000	1,152,000	\$5,506	\$2,270	\$24,800	\$580,000
2002	44	4,000	13	13,200	254	36	1.51	30,462	4,340	3.01	16,500	1,584,000	\$7,570	\$3,122	\$24,800	
2003	56	4,000	13	16,800	323	46	1.92	38,769	5,523	3.84	21,000	2,016,000	\$9,635	\$3,973	\$24,800	
2004	68	4,000	13	20,400	392	56	2.33	47,077	6,707	4.66	25,500	2,448,000	\$11,699	\$4,825	\$24,800	
2005	80	4,000	13	24,000	462	66	2.74	55,385	7,890	5.48	30,000	2,880,000	\$13,764	\$5,676	\$24,800	
2006	92	4,000	13	27,600	531	76	3.15	63,692	9,074	6.30	34,500	3,312,000	\$15,829	\$6,527	\$24,800	
2007	104	4,000	13	31,200	600	85	3.56	72,000	10,258	7.12	39,000	3,744,000	\$17,893	\$7,379	\$24,800	
2008	116	4,000	13	34,800	669	95	3.97	80,308	11,441	7.95	43,500	4,176,000	\$19,958	\$8,230	\$24,800	\$375,000
2009	128	4,000	13	38,400	738	105	4.38	88,615	12,625	8.77	48,000	4,608,000	\$22,022	\$9,082	\$24,800	
2010	140	4,000	13	42,000	808	115	4.79	96,923	13,808	9.59	52,500	5,040,000	\$24,087	\$9,933	\$24,800	
2011	152	4,000	13	45,600	877	125	5.21	105,231	14,992	10.41	57,000	5,472,000	\$26,152	\$10,784	\$24,800	
2012	164	4,000	13	49,200	946	135	5.62	113,538	16,175	11.23	61,500	5,904,000	\$28,216	\$11,636	\$24,800	
2013	176	4,000	13	52,800	1,015	145	6.03	121,846	17,359	12.05	66,000	6,336,000	\$30,281	\$12,487	\$24,800	
2014	188	4,000	13	56,400	1,085	155	6.44	130,154	18,542	12.88	70,500	6,768,000	\$32,345	\$13,339	\$24,800	
2015	200	4,000	13	60,000	1,154	164	6.85	138,462	19,726	13.70	75,000	7,200,000	\$34,410	\$14,190	\$24,800	
										1						
												Total	\$303,190	\$125,030	\$402,177	



## **CNG - Performance**

	Fuel								Electric			Total Energy		
FY	Therms	GGE	Cost		\$/GGE	\$/Th	CCF	kWh	kWh /GGE	Cost		Total Cost	Net \$/Th	Net \$/GGE
FY04	33,500	26,800	\$	26,329	\$0.98	0.7859	32,375	29,350	1.10	\$	1,656	\$27,985	\$0.84	\$1.04
FY05	42,107	33,686	\$	47,717	\$1.42	1.1332	41,788	42,802	1.27	\$	2,782	\$50,499	\$1.20	\$1.50
FY06	42,558	34,046	\$	60,274	\$1.77	1.4163	42,444	48,000	1.41	\$	3,231	\$63,506	\$1.49	\$1.87
FY07	40,820	32,656	\$	54,877	\$1.68	1.3444	40,646	47,099	1.44	\$	2,964	\$57,841	\$1.42	\$1.77
FY08	41,921	33,536	\$	84,536	\$2.52	2.0166	41,945	44,706	1.33	\$	3,087	\$87,623	\$2.09	\$2.61
FY09	41,795	33,436	\$	50,602	\$1.51	1.2107	41,358	44,518	1.33	\$	2,872	\$53,474	\$1.28	\$1.60
FY10	42,810	34,248	\$	60,643	\$1.77	1.4166	42,358	52,735	1.54	\$	3,400	\$64,042	\$1.50	\$1.87
Total	285,510	228,408	9	\$384,978	\$1.69	1.3484	282,914	309,211	1.35		19,992	\$404,970	\$1.42	\$1.77

Note: BNL GGE for 2010 was 23,913. The balance was consumed by others.



#### **CNG Fueling Facility Highlights**

Original Investment for CNG Station (2001)	\$	575,000	
Second Compressor (2005)	\$	190,000	
Control System Upgrade (2005)		\$25,000	
Total Station Infrastructure	\$	790,000	
Annual Maintenance Contract		\$4,800	
Total GGE produced to-date (2001-2010)		256,824	
Current annual production/usage (GGE)*		34,000	
Number of CNG vehicles in operation		75	
Production Costs			
Current fuel cost/GGE		\$1.77	
Current electric cost/GGE		\$0.09	
Maintenance/GGE		\$0.14	
Total Cost/GGE		\$2.01	1
es. * Includes Dowing College, Area Towns, etc.	8	BRU	VAL LABORATORY

Brookhaven Science Associate









Brookhaven Science Associates

## **CNG – Lessons Learned**

#### • OEM Manufacturers extremely limited

- Most have left the market
- Mainly pick-up trucks and vans
- Retrofits for new vehicles are very expensive
  - Conversions ~\$18,000/vehicle in addition to vehicle cost
  - May/will void manufacturers warranty

#### CNG Vehicles

- Require annual inspections of fuel systems
- Storage tanks lasting ~5 years Many fail inspection process
- Parts have become expensive, with some increasing by 3x in 5 years
- Less range than conventional fuel vehicles



## **CNG Summary**

- CNG vehicles are a practical, albeit expensive alternative to gasoline versions
  - Try to take advantage of grants and other incentives
    - Clean cities, NYSERA, etc.
- CNG better suited for:
  - Fleet operations and high usage per vehicle
    - Large infrastructure investment softened on a unit cost basis
  - Areas were low emissions are particularly important
    - Populated areas, long idling time, etc.

Must budget for additional maintenance and capital investments

- Compressor rebuild/replacements
- Tank certification and replacements
- Higher vehicle first cost

